

134-12/MFM
FREEHILL HOGAN & MAHAR, LLP
Attorneys for Petitioners/Plaintiffs
McALLISTER TOWING & TRANSPORTATION CO., INC.
and McALLISTER TOWING OF NEW YORK, LLC
80 Pine Street
New York, New York 10005
(212) 425-1900
Mark F. Muller, Esq.
John J. Walsh, Esq.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----X
In the Matter of the

IN ADMIRALTY

Complaint of Plaintiffs, McALLISTER
TOWING & TRANSPORTATION CO., INC. as
Owner and McALLISTER TOWING OF NEW
YORK, LLC, as Owner Pro Hac Vice of the Tug
PATRICE McALLISTER for Exoneration
from/or Limitation of Liability

**PETITIONERS/PLAINTIFFS'
RESPONSE TO CATERPILLAR
INC.'S CLAIM DATED 7/2/2012**

12 Civil 2505 (LAK)

-----X

McALLISTER TOWING & TRANSPORTATION CO., Inc. as Owner and
McALLISTER TOWING OF NEW YORK, LLC, as Owner Pro Hac Vice of the Tug PATRICE
McALLISTER (hereinafter referred to as "McALLISTER") by their attorneys, Freehill, Hogan
& Mahar LLP, responds to Caterpillar Inc.'s Claim dated July 2, 2012 upon information and
belief as follows:

FIRST: McALLISTER admits the allegations contained in paragraphs numbered "1,"
"3," "5," "6," "10" and "11" of Caterpillar Inc.'s Claim.

SECOND: McALLISTER denies any knowledge or information to form a belief as to
each and every allegation contained in paragraphs numbered "2" and "7" of Caterpillar Inc.'s
Claim.

THIRD: McALLISTER denies each and every allegation contained in paragraphs
numbered "8," "13" and "17" of Caterpillar Inc.'s Claim and refers all questions of law to the

Court.

FOURTH: McALLISTER denies each and every allegation contained in paragraphs numbered "14," "15," "18" and "19" of Caterpillar Inc.'s Claim.

FIFTH: Answering paragraph numbered "4," "9," "12" and "16" of Caterpillar Inc.'s Claim, McALLISTER repeats and reiterates each and every answer and denial contained in paragraphs numbered "FIRST through FOURTH" inclusive of its Response to Caterpillar Inc.'s Claim with the same force and effect as though fully set forth at length herein.

AS AND FOR A FIRST AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

SIXTH: In the event that this Honorable Court lacks jurisdiction over Ohio Machinery Company d/b/a Ohio Cat then this action should be transferred to Ohio federal court pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1404(a).

AS AND FOR A SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

SEVENTH: The incident onboard the tug PATRICE McALLISTER, including any loss, damages and/or injuries to persons onboard the tug, were not the result of any negligence, fault or want of due care on the part of McALLISTER.


WHEREFORE, McALLISTER demands that Caterpillar's Inc.'s Claim dated July 2, 2012 be dismissed with costs and attorneys' fees to McALLISTER as against Caterpillar Inc.

and that the Court grant to MCALLISTER such other, further and different relief as the justice of the cause may require.

Dated: October 11, 2012

FREEHILL HOGAN & MAHAR, LLP
Attorneys for Petitioners/Plaintiffs
McALLISTER TOWING & TRANSPORTATION CO., INC. and
McALLISTER TOWING OF NEW YORK, LLC

By:


Mark F. Muller
John J. Walsh
80 Pine Street
New York, New York 10005
Telephone: (212) 425-1900
Facsimile: (212) 425-1901
muller@freehill.com
walsh@freehill.com

TO: SEDGWICK, LLP
Attorneys for Claimant/Defendant
CATERPILLAR INC.
Three Gateway Center, Twelfth Floor
Newark, NJ 07102-4072
Attn: Shaun A. Bean, Esq.
Tel: 973-242-0002
shaun.bean@sedgwicklaw.com

TABAK, MELLUSI & SHISHA, LLP
Attorneys for Claimant
JOHN A. HOBAN, as Administrator and Personal
Representative of the Estate of Matthew A. Hoban
29 Broadway, Suite 2311
New York, New York 10006-3212
Attn: Jacob Shisha, Esq.
Attn: Ralph J. Mellusi, Esq.
jshisha@sealawyers.com

LATTI & ANDERSON, LLP

Attorneys for Claimant

JOHN A. HOBAN, as Administrator and Personal
Representative of the Estate of Matthew A. Hoban

30-31 Union Wharf

Boston, MA 02109

Clatti@lattianderson.com

Carolyn M. Latti, Esq.

RUBIN, FIORELLA & FRIEDMAN, LLP

Attorneys for Claimant

IRONHEAD MARINE, INC.

630 Third Avenue, 3rd Floor

New York, New York 10017

Tel: 212-953-2381

Attn: James E. Mercante, Esq.

Attn: Richard Gonzalez, Esq.

jmercante@rubinfiorella.com

rgonzalez@rubinfiorella.com

LYONS & FLOOD, LLP

Attorneys for Claimant

Ohio Machinery Company

d/b/a Ohio Cat

65 West 36th Stret, 7th Floor

New York, New York 10018

Attn: Edward P. Flood, Esq.

eflood@lyons-flood.com

Seth S. Holbrook, Esq.

Attorneys for Claimant

Ohio Machinery Company

d/b/a Ohio Cat

238-240 Lewis Wharf

Boston, MA 02110

Holbrook_murphy@msn.com